

Income, troubles and legal family formats in Italy

by Marco Gattuso 1

The LawsAndFamilies Database – Aspects of legal family formats for same-sex and different-sex couples

Edited by Kees Waaldijk,² Marie Digoix,³ Natalie Nikolina,² Giuseppe Zago,² Daniel Damonzé,² Arianna Caporali,³ Kamel Nait Abdellah ³ Published by INED, Paris, 2017, www.LawsAndFamilies.eu

Based on the LawsAndFamilies questionnaire on legal family formats for same-sex and/or different-sex couples (Section 2 – Income and troubles)

© 2017 Marco Gattuso

¹ Marco Gattuso (judge at the Court of Bologna; Director of Articolo29 and co-director of Genius, Rivista di studi giuridici sull'orientamento sessuale e l'identità di genere, www.articolo29.it) is grateful for the useful comments that Matteo M. Winkler (Dr. Jur., Ph.D., LL.M., Assistant Professor, HEC Paris) made on an earlier version of the answers in this section of the database.

² <u>Grotius Centre for International</u> <u>Legal Studies</u>, Leiden University, Netherlands, <u>www.leiden.edu</u>.



³ Institut national d'études démographiques, Paris, France, www.ined.fr.



Recommended citation:

M. Gattuso, 'Income, troubles and legal family formats in Italy', in: K. Waaldijk et al. (eds.), The LawsAndFamilies Database – Aspects of legal family formats for same-sex and different-sex couples, Paris: INED, 2017, www.LawsAndFamilies.eu (question 2.x).

Acknowledgment

The research leading to these results has received funding from the European Union's Seventh Framework Programme (FP7/2007-2013) under grant agreement no. 320116 for the research project FamiliesAndSocieties, www.familiesandsocieties.eu.



Families And **Societies**

Disclaimer

This paper and this database contain information with a scientific aim. Nothing in this paper and in this database should be seen as legal advice. Not all nuances and exceptions are included, and there may be errors and further legal developments. The experts, the authors, the editors, the Institut national d'études démographiques and Leiden University cannot be held liable for any inaccurate or incomplete information in this paper or in this database. More particularly, they cannot be held liable for any damage or consequences from the direct or indirect use of contents of this paper or database.

The six sections of the questionnaire

The $\underline{interactive\ LawsAndFamilies\ Database}$ is based on the $\underline{LawsAndFamilies}$ $\underline{questionnaire}$, which consists of six sections:

Section 1 - Formalisation

Section 2 - Income and troubles

Section 3 – Parenting

Section 4 – Migration

Section 5 – Splitting up

Section 6 – Death

Papers and an interactive database

For each jurisdiction there are therefore six papers like this one. And each of these papers contains the full answers, references and explanations (given by

a legal expert for the jurisdiction concerned) to the questions in one of these six sections. All these papers can be found in open access at www.LawsAndFamilies.eu. There the user also has access to the interactive part of the LawsAndFamilies Database, which can be used to search the whole database and to create comparative overviews for different questions, different years, different countries and/or different legal family formats.

This website also contains references to publications analysing the results of the project, and to some other legal, sociological and statistical publications about same-sex and different-sex families. And it gives information about the methodology used for this questionnaire and database.

About the questionnaire

The <u>full text of the questionnaire</u> can be found in the paper:

K. Waaldijk, J.M. Lorenzo Villaverde, N. Nikolina & G. Zago,

'The LawsAndFamilies questionnaire on legal family formats for same-sex and/or different-sex couples: Text of the questions and of the accompanying guidance document', *FamiliesAndSocieties Working Paper* 64(2016), www.familiesandsocieties.eu.

The <u>Guidance document</u> contained in that paper, asked the experts answering the questionnaire to make several assumptions. These included the assumption that the partners have been living together as a couple already for at least two years. Plus the assumption (except for certain questions in Section 4 – Migration) that both partners have the citizenship of the country where they are now both lawfully and habitually residing, and that this is also the country where their relationship would have been formalised and where it would be dissolved.

About the answers

This paper contains the answers, references and explanations – for one jurisdiction – to all questions in one of the six sections of the questionnaire. The answers are presented in columns. Each column is a coloured timeline, representing legal developments for one question for one legal family format.

The year at the top of each coloured timeline is the most recent year for which a question was answered by the author. In the timelines the years given above and below an answer indicate that the answer applied between a certain day in the lower year and a certain day in the higher year. The year "0000" means that the answer applied since an unknown year before 1965. See further the <u>Guidance document</u>.

The following **answer codes and colours** have been used:

Yes	Yes, this is so in the law of this country/jurisdiction, although possibly with a qualifying period of 24 months or less.
Yes, but	Yes, but with exceptions or restrictions, for example a qualifying period of 25 months or more, or only in most parts of the country/jurisdiction, or this is mostly a "dead letter".
No, but	No, but it may be so exceptionally, or in a very limited way, or in a few parts of the country/jurisdiction, or indirectly, or by using a different legal instrument, or legislation says no while some courts might say yes.
No	No, this is not so in the law of this country/jurisdiction.
Doubt	The law is unclear (the law does not "know" the answer).
Poubt ?	The law is unclear (the law does not "know" the answer). No information was available.
?	No information was available. Not applicable (for example because this family format is not available in this jurisdiction, or not for same-sex
? N/A	No information was available. Not applicable (for example because this family format is not available in this jurisdiction, or not for same-sex or different-sex couples).

The six papers about Italy

The answers concerning Italy can be found in the <u>interactive database</u> and in the following six papers (all of which are published in open access in:

K. Waaldijk et al. (eds.), *The LawsAndFamilies Database – Aspects of legal family formats for same-sex and different-sex couples*, Paris: INED, 2017, www.LawsAndFamilies.eu):

Formalisation of legal family formats in Italy by Matteo Winkler (Section 1)

Income, troubles and legal family formats in Italy by Marco Gattuso (Section 2)

Parenting and legal family formats in Italy by Matteo Winkler (Section 3)

Migration and legal family formats in Italy by Matteo Winkler (Section 4)

Splitting up and legal family formats in Italy by Marco Gattuso (Section 5)

Death and legal family formats in Italy by Marco Gattuso (Section 6)

So this paper is based on **Section 2 (Income and troubles)** of the <u>LawsAndFamilies questionnaire</u>, which contains questions about the following topics:

- 2.1 Lower income tax
- 2.2 Social benefits
- 2.3 Health insurance
- 2.4 Care between partners
- 2.5 Care for a parent
- 2.6 Next of kin
- 2.7 Domestic violence
- 2.8 Criminal procedure
- 2.9 General background regarding income and troubles

In the following pages of this paper, first the answer to question 2.9 is presented, followed by the answers to questions 2.1 to 2.8.

2.09 - General background regarding income and troubles (Open question)

If you consider it useful to provide some general information or comments about (past, present or future) developments and trends in legal policy and case law in your country/jurisdiction, or information on other aspects (socio-legal, political, legal-cultural, family support, etc.) that may be relevant for the understanding of your answers above regarding income and troubles, then please do so here.

As already pointed out answering some of the former questions, Italian law had a tremendous change due to the Law 20 May 2016, n. 76. Article 1, § 20, of this Law requires that all marriage rules about rights and duties apply now also to same-sex Civil Union. It has also to be said that in the past, in the absence of any legislation providing protection to same-sex couples, the Italian legal system had slowly developed thanks to the Italian jurisprudence. The Constitutional Court (judgment n. 138 of 15 March 2010) and the Italian Superior Court [Corte di Cassazione], judgment nr. 4184 of 2012 and nr. 2400 of 2015) stressed the necessity, even in absence of a law, to grant protection to fundamental rights of same-sex partners, leaving concrete solutions to the ordinary judges. These indications from the highest courts eventually led to a surprising activity of Italian courts (you may read almost all known Italian case law on the topic in the database of the site Articolo29 [www.articolo29.it]).

Source: M. Gattuso, "Income, troubles and legal family formats in Italy". In: K. Waaldijk et al. (eds.), *The LawsAndFamilies Database – Aspects of legal family formats for same-sex and different-sex couples.* Paris: INED, 2017, www.LawsAndFamilies.eu, <u>LawsAndFamilies-IT-Section2.pdf</u> (please use this full citation when citing any information from this table).

Section: 2 - Income and Troubles

Question: 2.01 - Lower income tax

Can a relationship of this type result in lower income tax than for two individuals without a partner?

Marriage		Registered partnership		Cohabitation		
diffsex	same-sex	diffsex	same-sex	diffsex	same-sex	
2016 No, but 1986	2016 N/A 0000	2016 N/A 0000	2016 No, but 2016	2016 No 0000	2016 No 0000	
? 0000			N/A 0000			
	References to legal sources: Presidential Decree of 22 December 1986, nr. 917.		References to legal sources: Presidential Decree of 22 December 1986, nr. 917. Law of 20 May 2016, nr. 76, article 1, § 20.		References to legal sources:	
Explanations and nuances: If one of the two members of the married couple has no income, the other member has a (little) tax reduction.		Explanations and nuances: If one of the two members of the married couple has no income, the other member has a (little) tax reduction. This rule now applies also to same-sex Civil Unions, due to the Law of 20 May 2016, n. 76, article 1, § 20.		Explanations and nuanc	es:	

Source: M. Gattuso, "Income, troubles and legal family formats in Italy". In: K. Waaldijk et al. (eds.), *The LawsAndFamilies Database – Aspects of legal family formats for same-sex and different-sex couples.* Paris: INED, 2017, www.LawsAndFamilies.eu, <u>LawsAndFamilies-IT-Section2.pdf</u> (please use this full citation when citing any information from this table).

Section: 2 - Income and Troubles

Question: 2.02 - Social benefits

When one partner (long-term unemployed or even never having been employed at all) would be entitled to a basic social benefit, will the income of the other partner then be taken into consideration and will it possibly result in loss or reduction of this entitlement?

Marriage		Registered partnership		Cohabitation	
diffsex	same-sex	diffsex	same-sex	diffsex	same-sex
2016 No, but 0000	2016 N/A 0000	2016 N/A 0000	2016 No, but 2016	2016 No 0000	2016 No 0000
			N/A 0000		
References to legal sources:		References to legal sources:		References to legal sources:	

Marriage		Registered partnership		Cohabitation	
diffsex	same-sex	diffsex	same-sex	diffsex	same-sex
Explanations and nuance In Italy there is no basic so long-term unemployment has only very short social few months (8-16 months) independent from the par older than 65 years, who have be entitled to special benefits, where the incomtaken into consideration at the loss of this entitlement certain level (nowadays €	cial benefit scheme for The Italian social system benefits which last only a and which are ther's income. People have been unemployed, social retirement be of the other partner is and may result even in t if it is higher than a	Explanations and nuances: See under Marriage.		Explanations and nuances:	

Source: M. Gattuso, "Income, troubles and legal family formats in Italy". In: K. Waaldijk et al. (eds.), *The LawsAndFamilies Database – Aspects of legal family formats for same-sex and different-sex couples.* Paris: INED, 2017, www.LawsAndFamilies.eu, <u>LawsAndFamilies-IT-Section2.pdf</u> (please use this full citation when citing any information from this table).

Section: 2 - Income and Troubles

Question: 2.03 - Health insurance

Is the amount of money that the two partners in this type of relationship would have to pay for (public or private) health insurance, normally smaller than what two individuals without a partner would have to pay?

Marriage		Registered partnership		Cohabitation	
diffsex	same-sex	diffsex	same-sex	diffsex	same-sex
2016 No, but 0000	2016 N/A 0000	2016 N/A 0000	2016 No, but 2016	2016 No, but 0000	2016 No, but 0000
			N/A 0000		
References to legal sources:		References to legal sources:		References to legal sources:	

Marriage		Registered partnership		Cohabitation	
diffsex	same-sex	diffsex	same-sex	diffsex	same-sex
Explanations and nuances:		Explanations and nuan	ces:	Explanations and nuanc	es:

Since Italian general tax system includes and covers all public expenses for the health system, it does not have a "public health insurance". General taxes may be influenced by marriage as already explained at question 2.01. Private health insurances do not have common rules and their conditions may differ heavily in the way they consider marriage.

Since Italian general tax system includes and covers all public expenses for the health system, it does not have a "public health insurance". General taxes may be influenced by same-sex Civil Union as already explained at question 2.01. Private health insurances do not have common rules and their conditions may differ heavily in the way they consider marriage and Civil Union.

Since Italian general tax system includes and covers all public expenses for the health system, it does not have a "public health insurance". Private health insurances do not have common rules and their conditions may differ heavily in the way they consider cohabitation. Nevertheless, we may say that they seldom ask for a smaller amount of money for individuals who cohabitate with a partner.

Downloaded on 2017-01-23

Jurisdiction: **Italy**

Source: M. Gattuso, "Income, troubles and legal family formats in Italy". In: K. Waaldijk et al. (eds.), *The LawsAndFamilies Database – Aspects of legal family formats for same-sex and different-sex couples.* Paris: INED, 2017, www.LawsAndFamilies.eu, <u>LawsAndFamilies-IT-Section2.pdf</u> (please use this full citation when citing any information from this table).

Section: 2 - Income and Troubles

Question: 2.04 - Care between partners

In case one partner is in need of care, does the other partner then have a statutory right to paid or unpaid leave to give that care?

Marriage		Registered partnership		Cohabitation	
diffsex	same-sex	diffsex	same-sex	diffsex	same-sex
2016 Yes 2000	2016 N/A 0000	2016 N/A 0000	2016 Yes 2016	2016 Yes 2000	2016 Yes, but 2010
Yes, but 1957			N/A 0000	No, but 1957	No, but 2000
					No, but 1957
References to legal sou Art. 4 of Law 8 March 200		References to legal sources: Art. 4 of Law 8 March 2000, n. 53.		References to legal sources: Art. 4 of Law 8 March 2000, n. 53.	
Art. 2 of Ministerial Decre	ee 21 July 2000, n. 278.	Art. 2 of Ministerial Decree 21 July 2000, n. 278.		Art. 2 of Ministerial Decree 21 July 2000, n. 27	
Art. 37 of President of the January 1957, n. 3.	e Republic Decree 10	Art. 37 of President of the Republic Decree 10 January 1957, n. 3.		Art. 37 of President of the January 1957, n. 3.	Republic Decree 10
		Law 20 May 2016, n. 76, a	article 1, § 20.		

Marriage	Registere	Registered partnership		Cohabitation	
diffsex same-se	x diffsex	same-sex	diffsex	same-sex	
Explanations and nuances: Paid leave: up to three days; unpaid leave: two years. Before 2000, admission to the leave was discretionary.	two years. This rule now applies al	nces: days; unpaid leave: up to lso to same-sex Civil Union, ay 2016, n. 76, article 1, §	Explanations and nuance Paid leave: up to three day two years. Art. 4 of the above mention "cohabitant" and does not means also same-sex part probably did not when the (2000), it would nowadays relations (recent Italian juit admit relevant differences different and same-sex co question 2.9, General back there are no published or so far. Before 2000, admission to discretionary and the law cohabitation at all: there a sex or same-sex cohabitat	oned Law refers to a specify whether it aners or not. Even if it a law entered into force a be applied to same-sex risprudence does not as in treatment between whabitations; see a kground). Nevertheless, known same-sex cases, where he leave was adid not mention are no known different-	

Source: M. Gattuso, "Income, troubles and legal family formats in Italy". In: K. Waaldijk et al. (eds.), *The LawsAndFamilies Database – Aspects of legal family formats for same-sex and different-sex couples.* Paris: INED, 2017, www.LawsAndFamilies.eu, <u>LawsAndFamilies-IT-Section2.pdf</u> (please use this full citation when citing any information from this table).

Section: 2 - Income and Troubles

Question: 2.05 - Care for a parent

In case the parent of one partner is in need of care, does the other partner then have a statutory right to paid or unpaid leave to give that care?

Marriage		Registered	Registered partnership		Cohabitation	
diffsex	same-sex	diffsex	same-sex	diffsex	same-sex	
2016 Yes 2000	2016 N/A 0000	2016 N/A 0000	2016 Yes 2016	2016 Yes 2000	2016 Yes, but 2010	
Yes, but 1957			N/A 0000	No, but 0000	No, but 2000	
					No, but 1957	
References to legal sou l Art. 4 of Law 8 March 200		References to legal sources: Art. 4 of Law 8 March 2000, n. 53.		References to legal sources: Art. 4 of Law 8 March 2000, n. 53.		
Art. 2 of Ministerial Decre	ee 21 July 2000, n. 278.	Art. 2 of Ministerial Decree 21 July 2000, n. 278.		Art. 2 of Ministerial Decree 21 July 2000, n. 27		
Art. 37 of President of the Republic Decree 10 January 1957, n. 3.		Art. 37 of President of the January 1957, n. 3.	e Republic Decree 10	Art. 37 of President of the January 1957, n. 3.	Republic Decree 10	
		Law 20 May 2016, n. 76, a	rticle 1, § 20.			

Marriage		Registered partnership		Cohabitation	
diffsex	same-sex	diffsex same-sex		diffsex	same-sex
Explanations and nuan Art. 4 of Law 8 March 200 partner's parents; see, th question 2.04.	00 applies also to the		00 applies also to the	Explanations and nuane Art. 4 of Law 8 March 200 partner's parents; see, th question 2.04.	00 applies also to the

Source: M. Gattuso, "Income, troubles and legal family formats in Italy". In: K. Waaldijk et al. (eds.), *The LawsAndFamilies Database – Aspects of legal family formats for same-sex and different-sex couples.* Paris: INED, 2017, www.LawsAndFamilies.eu, <u>LawsAndFamilies-IT-Section2.pdf</u> (please use this full citation when citing any information from this table).

Section: 2 - Income and Troubles

Question: 2.06 - Next of kin

In case of accident or illness of one partner, is the other partner considered as next of kin for medical purposes (even without power of attorney)?

Marriage		Registered partnership		Cohabitation	
diffsex	same-sex	diffsex	same-sex	diffsex	same-sex
2016 Yes 0000	2016 N/A 0000	2016 N/A 0000	2016 Yes 2016	2016 No 0000	2016 No 0000
			N/A 0000		
References to legal sources:		References to legal sources:		References to legal sources:	
Explanations and nuances:		Explanations and nuances:		Explanations and nuances:	

Source: M. Gattuso, "Income, troubles and legal family formats in Italy". In: K. Waaldijk et al. (eds.), *The LawsAndFamilies Database – Aspects of legal family formats for same-sex and different-sex couples.* Paris: INED, 2017, www.LawsAndFamilies.eu, <u>LawsAndFamilies-IT-Section2.pdf</u> (please use this full citation when citing any information from this table).

Section: 2 - Income and Troubles

Question: 2.07 - Domestic violence

When one partner uses violence against the other partner, does specific statutory protection apply?

Marriage		Registered partnership		Cohabitation	
diffsex	same-sex	diffsex	same-sex	diffsex	same-sex
2016 Yes 2001	2016 N/A 0000	2016 N/A 0000	2016 Yes 2016	2016 Yes 2001	2016 Yes, but 2010
No 0000			N/A 0000	No 0000	No, but 2001
					No 0000
References to legal sources: Art. 342 ter Civil Code, introduced by Law 4 April 2001 n. 154.		References to legal sources: Art. 342 ter Civil Code, introduced by Law 4 April 2001 n. 154. Law 20 May 2016, n. 76, article 1, § 20.		References to legal sources: Art. 342 ter, Civil Code, introduced by Law 4 Apr 2001 n. 154.	

Marriage		Registered partnership		Cohabitation	
diffsex	same-sex	diffsex	same-sex	diffsex	same-sex
Explanations and nuances:		Explanations and nuand The rule now applies also due to Law 20 May 2016,	to same-sex Civil Union,	Explanations and nuand Art. 342 ter refers to cohe specify whether it means or not. Even if it probably entered into force (2001), applied to same-sex for significant jurisprudence does not a in treatment between difficohabitations; see question background). Neverthelessame-sex cases, so far.	abitation and does not also same-sex relations did not when the law it would nowadays be ure (recent Italian dmit relevant differences ferent and same-sex

Downloaded on 2017-01-23

Jurisdiction: **Italy**

Source: M. Gattuso, "Income, troubles and legal family formats in Italy". In: K. Waaldijk et al. (eds.), *The LawsAndFamilies Database – Aspects of legal family formats for same-sex and different-sex couples.* Paris: INED, 2017, www.LawsAndFamilies.eu, <u>LawsAndFamilies-IT-Section2.pdf</u> (please use this full citation when citing any information from this table).

Section: 2 - Income and Troubles

Question: 2.08 - Criminal procedure

In case of a criminal prosecution against one partner, can the other partner then refuse to testify against the partner who is being prosecuted?

Marriage		Registered partnership		Cohabitation	
diffsex	same-sex	diffsex	same-sex	diffsex	same-sex
2016 Yes 0000	2016 N/A 0000	2016 N/A 0000	2016 Yes 2016	2016 Yes, but 0000	2016 Yes, but 1993
			N/A 0000		? 0000
References to legal sources: Art. 199 of the Criminal Procedure Code.		References to legal sources: Art. 199 of the Criminal Procedure Code.		References to legal sources: Art. 199 of the Criminal Procedure Code.	
Art. 307 of the Penal Code.		Art. 307 of the Penal Code.		Art. 307 of the Penal Code.	
		Art. 1, § 20, Law 20 May 2016, n. 76.			

itt	:p://lawsandfamilies-database.site.ined.fr/en/legal-project/interactive-databas	<u>se/</u>
	Downloaded on 2017-01-	23

Marriage		Registered partnership		Cohabitation	
diffsex	same-sex	diffsex	same-sex	diffsex	same-sex
Explanations and nuances:		Explanations and nuances:		Explanations and nuances: Art. 199 of the Criminal Procedure Code (which refers to the definition of "relatives" in art. 307 of the Penal Code) applies to cohabitants only for facts known during the cohabitation. The Corte d'Assise di Torino, in a decision of 19 November 1993, held that the provision applies also to samesex partners.	