BELAWSANDFAMILIES

Death and legal family formats in the UK: Scotland by Kenneth Norrie¹

The LawsAndFamilies Database – Aspects of legal family formats for same-sex and different-sex couples

Edited by Kees Waaldijk,² Marie Digoix,³ Natalie Nikolina,² Giuseppe Zago,² Daniel Damonzé,² Arianna Caporali,³ Kamel Nait Abdellah ³ Published by INED, Paris, 2017, <u>www.LawsAndFamilies.eu</u>

Based on the LawsAndFamilies questionnaire on legal family formats for same-sex and/or different-sex couples (Section 6 – Death)

© 2017 Kenneth Norrie

¹ Professor Kenneth McK. Norrie (Professor of Law, University of Strathclyde, Glasgow, Scotland) is grateful for the useful comments that Dr Andy Hayward (Lecturer in Family Law, Durham Law School, Durham University) made on an earlier version of the answers in this section of the database. ² <u>Grotius Centre for International</u> <u>Legal Studies</u>, Leiden University, Netherlands, <u>www.leiden.edu</u>.



³ Institut national d'études démographiques, Paris, France, <u>www.ined.fr</u>.



Recommended citation:

K. Norrie, 'Death and legal family formats in the UK: Scotland', in: K. Waaldijk et al. (eds.), *The LawsAndFamilies Database – Aspects of legal family formats for same-sex and different-sex couples*, Paris: INED, 2017, <u>www.LawsAndFamilies.eu</u> (question 6.x).

Acknowledgment

The research leading to these results has received funding from the European Union's Seventh Framework Programme (FP7/2007-2013) under grant agreement no. 320116 for the research project FamiliesAndSocieties, <u>www.familiesandsocieties.eu</u>.



Disclaimer

This paper and this database contain information with a scientific aim. Nothing in this paper and in this database should be seen as legal advice. Not all nuances and exceptions are included, and there may be errors and further legal developments. The experts, the authors, the editors, the Institut national d'études démographiques and Leiden University cannot be held liable for any inaccurate or incomplete information in this paper or in this database. More particularly, they cannot be held liable for any damage or consequences from the direct or indirect use of contents of this paper or database.

The six sections of the questionnaire

The <u>interactive LawsAndFamilies Database</u> is based on the <u>LawsAndFamilies</u> <u>questionnaire</u>, which consists of six sections:

Section 1 – Formalisation

Section 2 – Income and troubles

Section 3 – Parenting

Section 4 – Migration

Section 5 – Splitting up

Section 6 – Death

Papers and an interactive database

For each jurisdiction there are therefore six papers like this one. And each of these papers contains the full answers, references and explanations (given by

a legal expert for the jurisdiction concerned) to the questions in one of these six sections. All these papers can be found in open access at <u>www.LawsAndFamilies.eu</u>. There the user also has access to the <u>interactive</u> <u>part of the LawsAndFamilies Database</u>, which can be used to search the whole database and to create comparative overviews for different questions, different years, different countries and/or different legal family formats.

This website also contains references to publications analysing the results of the project, and to some other legal, sociological and statistical publications about same-sex and different-sex families. And it gives information about the methodology used for this questionnaire and database.

About the questionnaire

The <u>full text of the questionnaire</u> can be found in the paper: K. Waaldijk, J.M. Lorenzo Villaverde, N. Nikolina & G. Zago, 'The LawsAndFamilies questionnaire on legal family formats for same-sex and/or different-sex couples: Text of the questions and of the accompanying guidance document', *FamiliesAndSocieties Working Paper* 64(2016), <u>www.familiesandsocieties.eu</u>.

The <u>Guidance document</u> contained in that paper, asked the experts answering the questionnaire to make several assumptions. These included the assumption that the partners have been living together as a couple already for at least two years. Plus the assumption (except for certain questions in Section 4 – Migration) that both partners have the citizenship of the country where they are now both lawfully and habitually residing, and that this is also the country where their relationship would have been formalised and where it would be dissolved.

About the answers

This paper contains the answers, references and explanations – for one jurisdiction – to all questions in one of the six sections of the questionnaire. The answers are presented in columns. Each column is a coloured timeline, representing legal developments for one question for one legal family format.

The year at the top of each coloured timeline is the most recent year for which a question was answered by the author. In the timelines the years given above and below an answer indicate that the answer applied between a certain day in the lower year and a certain day in the higher year. The year "0000" means that the answer applied since an unknown year before 1965. See further the <u>Guidance document</u>.

The following answer codes and colours have been used:

Yes	Yes, this is so in the law of this country/jurisdiction, although possibly with a qualifying period of 24 months or less.
Yes, but	Yes, but with exceptions or restrictions, for example a qualifying period of 25 months or more, or only in most parts of the country/jurisdiction, or this is mostly a "dead letter".
No, but	No, but it may be so exceptionally, or in a very limited way, or in a few parts of the country/jurisdiction, or indirectly, or by using a different legal instrument, or legislation says no while some courts might say yes.
No	No, this is not so in the law of this country/jurisdiction.
Doubt	The law is unclear (the law does not "know" the answer).
?	No information was available.
N/A	Not applicable (for example because this family format is not available in this jurisdiction, or not for same-sex or different-sex couples).
Х	This question was not asked for this legal family format.
Open question	Question without answer codes like Yes and No.
Empty cell	For this year the question was not asked or not answered.

The six papers about Scotland

The answers concerning Scotland can be found in the <u>interactive database</u> and in the following six papers (all of which are published in open access in: K. Waaldijk et al. (eds.), *The LawsAndFamilies Database – Aspects of legal family formats for same-sex and different-sex couples*, Paris: INED, 2017, www.LawsAndFamilies.eu):

Formalisation of legal family formats in the UK: Scotland	l
by Kenneth Norrie (Section 1)	

- Income, troubles and legal family formats in the UK: Scotland by Kenneth Norrie (Section 2)
- Parenting and legal family formats in the UK: Scotland by Kenneth Norrie (Section 3)
- Migration and legal family formats in the UK: Scotland by Kenneth Norrie (Section 4)
- Splitting up and legal family formats in the UK: Scotland by Kenneth Norrie (Section 5)

Death and legal family formats in the UK: Scotland by Kenneth Norrie (Section 6)

So this paper is based on **Section 6 (Death)** of the <u>LawsAndFamilies</u> <u>questionnaire</u>, which contains questions about the following topics:

- 6.1 Tenancy continuation
- 6.2 Property at death
- 6.3 Inheritance
- 6.4 Inheritance tax
- 6.5 Survivor's pension
- 6.6 Wrongful death
- 6.7 General background regarding death

In the following pages of this paper, first the answer to question 6.7 is presented, followed by the answers to questions 6.1 to 6.6.

6.07 - General background regarding death (Open question)

If you consider it useful to provide some general information or comments about (past, present or future) developments and trends in legal policy and case law in your country/jurisdiction, or information on other aspects (socio-legal, political, legal-cultural, etc.) that may be relevant for the understanding your answers above regarding death, then please do so here. The backdating of survivors' pensions continues to be politically and legally contentious: see R Wintemute, "Does EU Law Permit Unequal Survivor's Pensions for Same-Sex Couples?" (2014) 43 INDUSTRIAL LAW JOURNAL 506 (where he suggests the answer is "no").

Source: K. Norrie, "Death and legal family formats in UK: Scotland". In: K. Waaldijk et al. (eds.), *The LawsAndFamilies Database – Aspects of legal family formats for same-sex and different-sex couples*. Paris: INED, 2017, www.LawsAndFamilies.eu, <u>LawsAndFamilies-UK_SC-Section6.pdf</u> (please use this full citation when citing any information from this table).

Section: 6 - Death

Question: 6.01 - Tenancy continuation

When the partner who holds the rental contract dies, does the other partner then have a right to continue to rent the home?

Mar	riage	Registered	partnership	Cohab	itation
diffsex	same-sex	diffsex	same-sex	diffsex	same-sex
2016 Yes, but 1980	2016 Yes, but 2014	2016 N/A 0000	2016 Yes, but 2005	2016 Yes, but 2001	2016 Yes, but 2001
Yes, but 0000	N/A 0000		N/A 0000	Yes, but 1987	Yes, but 1999
				Yes, but 1980	No 0000
				No 0000	

Marr	riage	Registered partnership		Cohabitation	
diffsex	same-sex	diffsex	same-sex	diffsex	same-sex
References to legal sour Tenants' Rights, Etc (Scoth Housing (Scotland) Act 19 Housing (Scotland) Act 20 3.	and) Act 1980, art. 13. 87, art. 52.	References to legal sourc Housing (Scotland) Act 200 3.		References to legal source Tenants' Rights, Etc (Scotla Housing (Scotland) Act 198 Housing (Scotland) Act 200 3. Fitzpatrick v Sterling Housi AC 27 (UK House of Lords 2	nd) Act 1980, art. 82. 87, art. 52. 91, art. 22 and schedule ng Association [2001] 1
Explanations and nuance Prior to the 1980 Act succe limited to widows, but sin spouse of either gender h continue the tenancy held spouse, but only if the ter tenancy" within the mean the 2001 Act, the same re tenancy is a "Scottish secu- terms of the 2001 Act (and spouses since 2014).	ession to tenancies was ice then a surviving has been entitled to d by their deceased hancy was a "secure hing of the 1987 Act. Since sult follows if the ured tenancy" within the	Explanations and nuance A surviving civil partner is a tenancy held by a decease if the tenancy is a "Scottish within the terms of the 200	entitled to continue the d civil partner, but only n secured tenancy"	Explanations and nuance Under the 1980 and 1987 / opposite-sex cohabitant we the tenancy held by a dece the tenancy was a "secure meaning of the Act. The sa cohabitant could succeed a tenant's family" only after s recognised as "family" for t House of Lords in 1999 bur right than for opposite-sex law is contained in the 200 opposite-sex and same-sex both can succeed to the te cohabitant so long as the t secured tenancy" within the	Acts a surviving as entitled to continue eased tenant, but only if tenancy" within the me-sex surviving as a "member of the same-sex couples were these purposes by the t this was a more limited couples. The current of Act which treats x cohabitants the same: mancy of their deceased tenancy is a "Scottish

Jurisdiction: UK: Scotland

Source: K. Norrie, "Death and legal family formats in UK: Scotland". In: K. Waaldijk et al. (eds.), *The LawsAndFamilies Database – Aspects of legal family formats for same-sex and different-sex couples*. Paris: INED, 2017, www.LawsAndFamilies.eu, <u>LawsAndFamilies-UK_SC-Section6.pdf</u> (please use this full citation when citing any information from this table).

Section: 6 - Death

Question: 6.02 - Property at death

When one partner dies, do statutory rules consider as joint property any possessions acquired by either of them after they started this type of relationship? (In other words: would the surviving partner be deemed to own 50% of these possessions, while the other 50% are subject to relevant rules of inheritance law?)

Marriage		Registered partnership		Cohabitation	
same-sex	diffsex	same-sex	diffsex	same-sex	
2016 No, but 2014	2016 N/A 0000	2016 No, but 2005	2016 No 0000	2016 No 0000	
N/A 0000		N/A 0000			
References to legal sources: Succession (Scotland) Act 1964, arts. 8 and 9.		References to legal sources: Succession (Scotland) Act 1964.		rces:	
	same-sex 2016 No, but 2014 N/A 0000	same-sex diffsex 2016 No, but 2014 2016 N/A 0000 N/A 0000 References to legal sour Succession (Scotland) Action	same-sexdiffsexsame-sex2016 No, but 20142016 N/A 00002016 No, but 2005N/A 000000002016 No, but 2005N/A 0000N/A 0000N/A 0000es: 064, arts. 8 and 9.References to legal sources: Succession (Scotland) Act 1964.	same-sexdiffsexsame-sexdiffsex2016 No, but 20142016 N/A 00002016 No, but 20052016 No 0000N/A 0000N/A O000N/A O000N/A O000N/A 0000References to legal sources:References to legal sources	

Marriage		Registered partnership		Cohabitation	
diffsex	same-sex	diffsex	same-sex	diffsex	same-sex
Explanations and nuance Property is not regarded at the death of one spouse to to claim various statutory intestacy up to certain ab- called "prior rights"). Spou claim one third of the mo- if there are no children (the "legal rights"): this claim is so is claimable from both intestate estate. The prop- joint property but the effect	as joint property but on the other will be entitled rights of inheritance on solute values (these are uses may in addition then veable estate, or one half his entitlement is called s indefeasible by will and the testate and the perty is not considered	Explanations and nuane Civil partners have the sa prior rights under the 196 equivalent of legal rights, the 2004 Act.	me claims as spouses, to 64 Act and to the	Explanations and nuan Cohabitants have no auto part of the estate of their	omatic entitlement to any

Source: K. Norrie, "Death and legal family formats in UK: Scotland". In: K. Waaldijk et al. (eds.), *The LawsAndFamilies Database – Aspects of legal family formats for same-sex and different-sex couples*. Paris: INED, 2017, www.LawsAndFamilies.eu, <u>LawsAndFamilies-UK_SC-Section6.pdf</u> (please use this full citation when citing any information from this table).

Section: 6 - Death

Question: 6.03 - Inheritance

When one partner dies without testament, is the other partner then an inheritor?

Marriage		Registered partnership		Cohabitation	
diffsex	same-sex	diffsex	same-sex	diffsex	same-sex
2016 Yes 0000	2016 Yes 2014	2016 N/A 0000	2016 Yes 2005	2016 No, but 2006	2016 No, but 2006
	N/A 0000		N/A 0000	No 0000	No 0000
References to legal sou Succession (Scotland) Act		References to legal sources: Succession (Scotland) Act 1964.References to legal so Family Law (Scotland) A Civil Partnership Act 2004, art. 131.			

Marriage		Registered	partnership	Cohabitation	
diffsex	same-sex	diffsex	same-sex	diffsex	same-sex
Explanations and nuand A spouse will inherit what from an intestate estate, values. Thereafter a spou or one half of the moveau whether there are survivi testacy and intestacy. If a spouse will inherit the res superior claims by childred It is worth noting that the succession law is current the Scottish Government changes will be brought to Parliament within a few y likely to include amending succession (currently the 1964) and in relation to ch cohabitants (currently the Act 2006, s. 29).	t are called "prior rights" up to certain absolute use is entitled to one third ole estate (depending on ng children), this on both nything remains, a sidue if there are no en, siblings or parents. e whole of Scottish ly (2016) under review by and it is likely that major before the Scottish rears. These changes are g the rules on intestate Succession (Scotland) Act laims by surviving	Explanations and nuand A civil partner will inherit rights" from an intestate partner, up to certain abs the civil partner is entitled of the moveable estate (of there are surviving childred and intestacy. If anything civil partner will inherit the superior claims by childred It is worth noting that the succession law is current the Scottish Government changes will be brought to Parliament within a few y likely to include amendin, succession (currently the 1964) and in relation to co cohabitants (currently the Act 2006, s. 29).	what are called "prior estate of their deceased solute values. Thereafter d to one third or one half lepending on whether en), this on both testacy remains the surviving he residue if there are no en, siblings or parents. e whole of Scottish ly (2016) under review by and it is likely that major before the Scottish ears. These changes are g the rules on intestate Succession (Scotland) Act laims by surviving	Explanations and nuanc Prior to the 2006 Act a sur- claim to the estate of their surviving cohabitant still h he or she may ask the cou- from the intestate estate, greater than a spouse wo in the same circumstance. It is worth noting that the succession law is currently the Scottish Government changes will be brought b Parliament within a few you likely to include amending succession (currently the 1964) and especially in ref surviving cohabitants (cur (Scotland) Act 2006, s. 29) problems in application.	rviving cohabitant had no r deceased partner. A has no entitlement, but up to an amount no buld have been entitled to es. whole of Scottish y (2016) under review by and it is likely that major before the Scottish ears. These changes are g the rules on intestate Succession (Scotland) Act lation to claims by rrently the Family Law

Source: K. Norrie, "Death and legal family formats in UK: Scotland". In: K. Waaldijk et al. (eds.), *The LawsAndFamilies Database – Aspects of legal family formats for same-sex and different-sex couples*. Paris: INED, 2017, www.LawsAndFamilies.eu, <u>LawsAndFamilies-UK_SC-Section6.pdf</u> (please use this full citation when citing any information from this table).

Section: 6 - Death

Question: 6.04 - Inheritance tax

Is the surviving partner exempted from paying inheritance tax (or required to pay less than a mere friend would have to pay)?

Marriage		Registered partnership		Cohabitation	
diffsex	same-sex	diffsex	same-sex	diffsex	same-sex
2016 Yes 1975	2016 Yes 2014	2016 N/A 0000	2016 Yes 2005	2016 No 0000	2016 No 0000
No 0000	N/A 0000		N/A 0000		
References to legal sources: Finance Act 1894. Finance Act 1975.		References to legal sources: Inheritance Tax Act 1984, article 18, as amended by Tax and Civil Partnership Regulations 2005, SI 2005/3229, art. 7(5).		References to legal sour	ces:
nheritance Tax Act 1984, a	article 18.				

Marriage		Registered partnership		Cohab	Cohabitation	
diffsex	same-sex	diffsex	same-sex	diffsex	same-sex	
Explanations and nuanc Estate Duty was introduce 1894 but a spousal exemp introduced when the 1975 duty with Capital Transfer remodelled and renamed 1984 Act, which contains t and remains the law today	ed by the Finance Act otion was only 5 Act replaced estate Tax (CTT). CTT was Inheritance Tax by the che spousal exemption	Explanations and nuan Civil Partners were broug exemption to Inheritance partnership was introduc	ght within the spousal e Tax when civil	Explanations and nuand	:es:	

Source: K. Norrie, "Death and legal family formats in UK: Scotland". In: K. Waaldijk et al. (eds.), *The LawsAndFamilies Database – Aspects of legal family formats for same-sex and different-sex couples*. Paris: INED, 2017, www.LawsAndFamilies.eu, <u>LawsAndFamilies-UK_SC-Section6.pdf</u> (please use this full citation when citing any information from this table).

Section: 6 - Death

Question: 6.05 - Survivor's pension

When one partner dies while being employed, is the surviving partner then normally entitled to a survivor's pension? (For example on the basis of statutory law, and/or on the basis of a collective labour agreement or arrangements of the employer.)

Marriage		Registered	partnership	Cohabitation	
diffsex	same-sex	diffsex	same-sex	diffsex	same-sex
2016 Yes 1988	2016 Yes, but 2014	2016 N/A 0000	2016 Yes, but 2005	2016 No, but 0000	2016 No, but 0000
Yes, but 1978	N/A 0000		N/A 0000		
No 0000					

Marriage		Registered partnership		Cohabitation	
diffsex	same-sex	diffsex	same-sex	diffsex	same-sex
References to legal source Social Security and Pension Social Security Act 1986. Equality Act 2010, sched. 9 (Walker v Innospec [2015] EV and Wales Court of Appeal) Marriage and Civil Partners Barber v Guardian Royal Ex 513.	ns Act 1975. para 18. WCA Civ 1000 (England). hip (Scotland) Act 2014.	References to legal sourc HM Gov's "Review of Surviv Occupational Pension Sche Civil Partnership Act 2004. Walker v Innospec [2015] E and Wales Court of Appeal;	vor Benefits in mes". WCA Civ 1000 (England	References to legal sources:	

suggests the answer is "no").

Marriage		Registered partnership		Cohabitation	
diffsex	same-sex	diffsex	same-sex	diffsex	same-sex
Both Acts allowed accrue date the Acts came into fe of Justice in Barber v Gua required benefits to be pl and women and since the spouses have been value since 1988. When same-s introduced in 2014, surviv limited to rights accrued s (when the Civil Partnersh force): this difference in t not contrary to the Equal sched. 9 para. 18. And the England and Wales held t to the European Union La same-sex spouses, the va pension will be less than spouses. The backdating of survivo be politically and legally of Wintemute, "Does EU Law	nemes did not typically vivors' pensions until the t in 1978, but that Act survivors: so the answer only if the survivor was ty Act 1986, which came ded this to male survivors. d rights only from the orce. The European Court ordian Royal Exchange rovided equally to men en survivor pensions to ed only on rights accrued sex marriage was vor pensions could be since 5th December 2005 ip Act 2004 came into creatment is legislatively ity Act 2010: 2010 Act, e Court of Appeal in that this was not contrary aw. So for many married alue of their survivor's that of opposite-sex	Explanations and nuane When civil partnership was pensions could be limited 5th December 2005 (when force): this difference in t not contrary to the Equal sched. 9 para. 18. And the England and Wales held to to the European Union Las partners, the value of the be less than that of oppo the article by Wintemute, Marriage.	as introduced, survivor I to rights accrued since In the 2004 Act came into reatment is legislatively ity Act 2010: 2010 Act, e Court of Appeal in hat this was not contrary aw. So for many civil ir survivor's pension will site-sex spouses. See also	Explanations and nuane Survivor's pensions are no though many schemes per person (including of the so individual to receive benefits)	ot mandated by the law, ermit an unmarried same-sex) to nominate ar

Source: K. Norrie, "Death and legal family formats in UK: Scotland". In: K. Waaldijk et al. (eds.), *The LawsAndFamilies Database – Aspects of legal family formats for same-sex and different-sex couples*. Paris: INED, 2017, www.LawsAndFamilies.eu, <u>LawsAndFamilies-UK_SC-Section6.pdf</u> (please use this full citation when citing any information from this table).

Section: 6 - Death

Question: 6.06 - Wrongful death

In case of wrongful death of one partner, is the other partner then entitled to compensation from the wrongdoer?

Marriage		Registered partnership		Cohabitation	
diffsex	same-sex	diffsex	same-sex	diffsex	same-sex
2016 Yes 0000	2016 Yes 2014	2016 N/A 0000	2016 Yes 2005	2016 Yes 1982	2016 Yes 2006
	N/A 0000		No 0000	No 0000	Doubt 2004
					No 0000

Marriage		Registered partnership		Cohabitation	
diffsex	same-sex	diffsex	same-sex	diffsex	same-sex
References to legal sour Damages (Scotland) Act 1 Damages (Scotland) Act 2 Marriage and Civil Partne	976. 011.	References to legal source Damages (Scotland) Act 19 Civil Partnership Act 2004. Family Law (Scotland) Act 20 Damages (Scotland) Act 20	76. 2006.	References to legal sour Ghaidan v Godin-Mendoz House of Lords 21 June 20 Administration of Justice A Damages (Scotland) Act 1 Family Law (Scotland) Act Damages (Scotland) Act 2	za (2004) UKHL 30 (UK 004). Act 1982. 976. 2006.
Explanations and nuances: Spouses have always been entitled to a loss of support award and a loss of society award (a bereavement award). This was put onto a statutory basis by the 1976 Act and the present law is contained in the 2011 Act. The 2014 Act opened marriage to same-sex couples and all married couples are included in the terms of the 2011 Act.		Explanations and nuances: The Civil Partnership Act 2004 amended the 1976 Act to give civil partners a right to claim compensation on the death of their partner on the same basis as a spouse could claim; the current law is the Damages (Scotland) Act 2011.		Explanations and nuances: The Administration of Justice Act 1982 amended the Damages (Scotland) Act 1976 to include (opposite-sex) cohabitants in the right under the 1976 Act to claim damages for wrongful death, both for loss of support and loss of society. The House of Lords in the case of Ghaidan v Godin- Mendoza decided that provisions relating to cohabitants ought where possible to be interpreted to include same-sex couples but it was not clear that the 1976 Act (as amended by the 1982 Act) could be so interpreted since it was gender-specific in its wording. The matter was put beyond all doubt by the Family Law (Scotland) Act 2006, and same-sex cohabitants are now treated in the same way as opposite-sex cohabitants. The current law is contained in the Damages (Scotland) Act 2011.	